

**NORTH BAY WATER REUSE AUTHORITY
TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE**

Thursday, December 7, 2023

Agenda

2:00 PM

Zoom Meeting: <https://us02web.zoom.us/j/81859156246>

	1.		Call to Order and Self Introductions
	2.	Action	Approval of Agenda
	3.		Public Comments
Pages 2 – 3	4.	Action	TAC Meeting Minutes of September 7, 2023
Pages 4 - 11	5.	Discussion	Resilience Arena Status Reports
Page 12	6.	Discussion	Collaborative Efforts with NBWA
Page 13	7.	Discussion	FY2023/24 Budget
	8.	Information	Next Meeting, January 4, 2024 Continue with first Thursday of the month at 2:00 p.m.
	9.		Adjournment

**North Bay Water Reuse Authority
Technical Advisory Committee
Zoom Meeting Minutes
September 7, 2023**

DRAFT

Approved _____

1. Call to Order and Self Introductions

Chair Healy called the Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) meeting to order at 2:04 p.m. on Thursday, September 7, 2023. The meeting was a Zoom meeting only and attendees participated via the following link: <https://us02web.zoom.us/j/81859156246>.

Committee Members Present

Tim Healy, Chair	Napa Sanitation District
Pam Jeane, Vice Chair	Sonoma Valley County Sanitation District
Kevin Booker	Sonoma Water
Chris Choo	Marin County
Dan Herrera	City of Petaluma
Curtis Paxton	Las Gallinas Valley Sanitary District
Chelsea Thompson	City of Petaluma
Tony Williams	North Marin Water District

Others Present

Member Agencies
None

Consultant Team

Chuck Weir, Program Manager	Weir Technical Services
Rene Guillen	Brown & Caldwell
Jim O'Toole	ESA
Mike Savage	Data Instincts

2. Approval of the Agenda

The Agenda was approved with no changes. Dan Herrera introduced himself to the group.

3. Public Comments

There were no public comments.

4. TAC Meeting Minutes of April 6, 2023

The TAC Meeting Minutes of April 6, 2023 were unanimously approved with two abstentions.

5. Resilience Arena Status Reports

Rene Guillen and Jim O'Toole provided status reports on the three Resilience Arena Projects: Recycled Water Support, Drought Contingency Planning, and Sea Level Rise Adaptation. The latter two are just getting underway and kick off meetings will be scheduled in the near future.

Recycled Water Support continues with updates to the NEPA process and financial capability analysis.

6. Collaborative Efforts with NBWA

Program Manager Weir provided a summary of the meeting held on July 25, 2023 and the plans to set up a Workshop to further develop plans for cooperative efforts between the two organizations.

7. FY2023/24 Budget

Since the consultant agreements were delayed in getting approved the Resilience Arena Projects are just now getting underway. It is unlikely that a budget for FY2023/24 will be needed. However, the Technical Team and TAC should start thinking about a budget for FY2024/25. Member agencies should put something in their budget as a placeholder for NBWRA.

8. Next Meeting

The next meeting is scheduled for October 5, 2023. The TAC discussed the need for a Board meeting and determined that one was not necessary until there is progress on the Resilience Arena Projects or there is something for discussion or action with NBWA.

11. Adjournment

There being no further business, Chair Healy adjourned the meeting at 2:25 p.m.

C:\Users\chuck\Documents\Weir Technical Services\NBWRA\Agendas\2023\TAC_Sep_2023\2023_09_07_NBWRA_TAC_Minutes.docx

ITEM NO. 5 RESILIENCE ARENA STATUS REPORTS

Action Requested

None at this time.

Summary

Resiliency Arena 1: Recycled Water Support

Task 2. Environmental Evaluation

Several tasks to move environmental evaluation forward, as summarized below:

- Submittal of Administrative Draft Biological Assessment (BA) for Reclamation Review
 - ESA has received and completed comments on BA. Awaiting comments on Fisheries BA
- ESA has completed Admin Draft EA for Reclamation Review
- ESA has completed Cultural Resources Section 106 Addendum for Reclamation Review

Task 3 – Financial Capabilities Determination

- **Goal:** Update the Financial Capability Determination (FCD) Report to align with updates that were made to the Phase 2 Title XVI Feasibility Study Report.
- Prepared and distributed RFI to help update the FCD Report. Information from this RFI is the basis of the ongoing update.
- FCD needs to be submitted to Reclamation for review and approval. Without completion of this report, grant funds awarded through the Title XVI Program cannot be disbursed.

Resiliency Arena 3: Drought Contingency Planning

- **Goal:** Allow NBWRA member agencies to make revisions or enhancements to the Regional Water Supply Resiliency Study to afford them the opportunity to apply for U.S. Bureau of Reclamation funding under the “Drought Resiliency Program.”
- The Study is still being developed. Only a portion of the document has been completed to date.
- Need this document to be completed (or close to completion) as it will form the basis of the analysis.

Resiliency Arena 4: Sea Level Rise Adaptation

- ESA attended NBWA Board meeting and Presented on Resiliency Arenas and Sea Level Rise. The Program Manager also attended.
- Agency Coordination Meeting Invites out for December.

Page 2

Agenda Explanation
North Bay Water Reuse Authority
Technical Advisory Committee
December 7, 2023

- ESA has distributed a doodle poll for potential dates for a 1 hour kickoff meeting to start into the Sea Level Rise Vision Process. The Board approved scope of work was included in the poll and is also attached to this report.

Recommendation

None at this time.

Scope of Work – Sea Level Rise Adaptation Plan

The following scope describes the services to develop a Sea Level Rise (SLR) Adaptation Plan, which will be used to develop a Marin County focused plan.

Task 1 – Project Management

The Consultant will provide monthly progress reports via email to the Project Manager summarizing project status, identifying outstanding data needs, and noting challenges or risks that may impact budget or schedule. Prepare monthly invoices and track schedule and progress of project.

Task 1 Deliverables

- Monthly progress reports and invoices.

Task 1 Assumptions

- Up to 12 months of PM services and monthly progress reports.

Task 2. Strategic Outreach and Coordination

The Consultant will work with Member Agencies to develop a strategic outreach plan aimed at validating SLR risks and vulnerabilities and building stakeholder (landowner) support for future adaptation concepts. Anticipated aspects of the outreach plan are described below:

1. **Strategic Outreach/Coordination Plan.** A strategic outreach plan (draft and final) will be developed that identifies the goals of outreach, key stakeholders, the number of stakeholder outreach meetings, and the content and objectives of each outreach meeting.
2. **External Stakeholder Outreach Meetings.** In partial implementation of the strategic outreach plan, the Consultant will meet twice with key stakeholders. The first meeting will likely explain risks and vulnerabilities to landowners identified in the Strategic Outreach/Coordination Plan to solicit input on adaptation strategies. This meeting will provide refinement of the screening criteria in Task 3 and development and evaluation of adaptation concepts in Task 5. In a second meeting, both stakeholders and also select members of the broader community (to be determined by the project team and potentially, the TAC) will be invited. The preliminary adaptation options developed in Task 5 will be shared and feedback received. The Consultant will support facilitation of these meeting with the development of materials, presentation, and agendas for the meetings
3. **Stakeholder Public Meeting/Charette.** A public meeting will be facilitated to review adaptation strategies and garner input.

Task 2 Deliverables:

- Draft and final Strategic Outreach Plan.

Task 2 Assumptions:

- Quality reviews will be conducted on deliverables prior to submittal to NBWRA member agencies. Deliverables will be submitted to NBWRA member agencies initially as a draft for review, then as final to address review comments.
- NBWRA member agencies will provide a single set of collated comments using a comment log. Consultant team will document follow-up actions or rationale (if not revising a work product to incorporate one or more NBWRA member agencies comment[s]) in the comment log.
- The NBWRA member agencies will have 10 days to review the Strategic Outreach Plan.
- Up to two (2) meetings with external stakeholders including meeting attendance/facilitation, technical content development/presentation, and action items. It is assumed that the meetings will be attended by up to three Consultant staff and be up to two hours in duration.
- One (1) Public Meeting including meeting attendance/facilitation, presentations as appropriate, and action items follow up. It is also assumed that TAC meeting content, agendas, etc. will be identical to the content developed for external stakeholder meetings. It is assumed that the meeting will be attended by up to three Consultant staff and be up to two hours in duration.
- Attendance at additional stakeholder meetings and/or City Council briefings identified in Strategic Outreach plan are not included in the scope. Addition of the activities will require an amendment.

Task 3. Decision Making Framework

This task provides the framework in which the NBWRA and stakeholders will consider and decide about their shoreline adaptation. The goals/vision/and screening criteria that form part of the framework may need to be vetted with stakeholders at a future date in order to get buy-in. A vetting may be identified in the Strategic Outreach Plan.

- A risk-informed decision-support framework will be drafted that includes an initial vision, goals, and objectives of adaptation planning. The framework will include recommended preliminary screening/and evaluation criteria that can be modified with city and stakeholder input as appropriate. Starting with standard criteria often used in flood risk management (such as frequency of flooding, reduced damages, etc.), and then possibly adding up to 8 NBWRA or stakeholder-driven criteria such as i) the types of permits needed, ii) potential acquisition issues for various concepts, and/or iii) those criteria developed in the Adapting to Rising Tides program, to support decision-making and better reflect unique interests and value of NBWRA.
- The Consultant will meet with the NBWRA project manager to discuss the framework in the context of the memo, solicit input, and revise as necessary. General feedback from external stakeholder Meeting #1 in Task 2 may also inform the draft or revision of the decision framework.

Task 3 Deliverables:

- Draft and final Decision-Support Technical Memorandum (TM).

Task 3 Assumptions:

- Quality reviews will be conducted on deliverables prior to submittal to NBWRA member agencies. Deliverables will be submitted to NBWRA member agencies initially as a draft for review, then as final to address review comments.
- NBWRA member agencies will provide a single set of collated comments using a comment log. Consultant team will document follow-up actions or rationale (if not revising a work product to incorporate one or more NBWRA member agencies comment[s]) in the comment log.
- The NBWRA member agencies will have 10 days to review the draft TM.
- A maximum of eight (8) hours has been budgeted for responding to comments and questions on the submitted TM.

Task 4. Understand Risks and Vulnerabilities

Existing studies will be reviewed and synthesize the primary concerns identified therein, studies include: Marin County Hazard Management Plan, BayWave vulnerability assessment; Marin County General Plan update, the latest FEMA FIRM mapping, BCDC Guidance; and other studies. Our focus will be applying work completed to date to adaptation strategies that can inform a list of projects for funding. New analyses or data will not be developed.

Key risks and vulnerabilities in the project area will be identified. This includes highlighting where risks may be the greatest or most urgent, and whether there are areas or risks which would be considered intolerable. This information will be used to identify key or priority areas. The Consultant will meet with County and City Floodplain Administrators to validate findings in terms of key vulnerabilities/risks, and to collect additional critical information from those staff that may be discussed in the meeting. The key risks and priorities identified in this task will be used for the set of concepts/alternatives developed in Task 5.

Following the review, possible information gaps to more fully understanding risks will be identified. Recommendations for filling those gaps will be provided as part of Task 7, along with preliminary cost estimates associated with the recommendations.

Task 4 Deliverables:

- Draft and final TM that summarizes key risks and vulnerabilities.

Task 4 Assumptions:

- Member Agencies will provide noted studies and other pertinent documents within 5 days of the submitted request.
- Quality reviews will be conducted on deliverables prior to submittal to NBWRA member agencies. Deliverables will be submitted to NBWRA member agencies initially as a draft for review, then as final to address review comments.
- NBWRA member agencies will provide a single set of collated comments using a comment log. Consultant team will document follow-up actions or rationale (if not revising a work product to incorporate one or more NBWRA member agencies comment[s]) in the comment log.
- The NBWRA member agencies will have 10 days to review the draft TM.
- TM is intended for an educated lay-person audience, i.e., memo will assume readers understand what SLR is, its causes, etc. and will focus on highlighting key risks that will be addressed by adaptation concepts identified in subsequent tasks.

Task 5. Identify and Screen Adaptation Options to Reduce Risks and Vulnerabilities

The Consultant will identify up to three (3) concepts to reduce the risks and vulnerabilities identified in Task 4 above. Adaptation concepts will include a range of structural and nonstructural options, and at least one nature-based or multi-benefit strategy.

The Consultant will then use a matrix to screen/evaluate the adaptation concepts with the screening criteria established in Task 3. This screening/evaluation will consider how well each of the concepts perform compared to the criteria and whether or how they work toward the established goals.

As appropriate, one-page project summary sheets and background information will be developed to support funding applications. A CIP list of projects will be developed for articulation at both an individual project and overall program. Up to ten project descriptions will be developed.

Task 5 Deliverables:

- Preliminary Draft, Administrative Draft, and final TM describing the adaptation concepts and the results of the evaluation process.

Task 5 Assumptions:

- Quality reviews will be conducted on deliverables prior to submittal to NBWRA member agencies. Deliverables will be submitted to NBWRA member agencies initially as a draft for review, then as final to address review comments.
- North Bay Watershed Association (NBWA) will review the Preliminary Draft and provide a single set of collated comments using a comment log. Consultant team will document follow-up actions or rationale (if not revising a work product to incorporate one or more NBWA comment[s]) in the comment log.
- The Administrative Draft TM will be presented to stakeholders at External Stakeholder meeting #2, and the Final TM will incorporate feedback (as appropriate) from External Stakeholder meeting #2.
- NBWRA member agencies will provide a single set of collated comments using a comment log. Consultant team will document follow-up actions or rationale (if not revising a work product to incorporate one or more NBWRA member agencies comment[s]) in the comment log.
- The NBWRA member agencies will have 10 days to review the draft TM.
- Services will be provided up to the limit of the budget.

Task 6. Advance and Illustrate Concepts for Further Consideration

The Consultant and the NBWRA Member Agencies will come to an agreement on the two highest scoring adaptation concepts to illustrate and advance for future consideration. Illustrating the concepts will give stakeholders and Member Agencies a better vision for what future adaptation concepts could look like on the ground with context which can offer clarity, generate enthusiasm for concepts, and dispel fears about the unknowns. It is assumed that illustrations will demonstrate concepts in context but will not be detailed enough to support feasibility or engineering analyses.

- The Consultant will work with NBWRA to select 2 top concepts for advancement that consider the results of the screening evaluation and stakeholder input received from Stakeholder Meeting #2.

- Create graphic renderings of the 2 selected adaptation concepts.

Task 6 Deliverables:

- Draft and final illustrations of two selected adaptation concepts.

Task 6 Assumptions:

- Services will be provided up to the limit of the budget.

Task 7. Next Steps Strategy and Final Presentation

A memo will be developed that identifies the next steps for the NBWRA to advance shoreline adaptation. The memo will recommend sequencing, and may include items like:

- Key studies gaps that must be filled, and why
- Hydraulic and hydrologic modeling that may be needed to better evaluate how adaptation concepts reduce flood risks.
- Additional studies or analysis needed to refine the adaptation concepts evaluation, i.e., economics/benefit-cost analysis, cost estimates of adaptation concepts
- Key Projects that Can be applied for funding programs
- Anticipated permitting, rights of way, policy challenges that may need to be addressed, as identified through screening in task 5b.
- Potential land use changes or zoning updates that may be required.
- List of additional agencies/stakeholders likely needed to advance the effort and/or fund, permit, construct, implement.
- Sequencing of the steps with rough time frame.

As part of this task, a final summary presentation will be developed to identify the key messages for the NBWRA Member Agencies and stakeholders, likely including an overview of the project process, the key findings, and next steps.

Task 7 Deliverables:

- Draft and final TM that summarizes next steps strategy.
- Draft and final summary presentation.

Task 7 Assumptions:

- Quality reviews will be conducted on deliverables prior to submittal to NBWRA member agencies. Deliverables will be conducted to NBWRA member agencies initially as a draft for review, then as final to address review comments.
- NBWRA member agencies will provide a single set of collated comments using a comment log. Consultant team will document follow-up actions or rationale (if not revising a work product to incorporate one or more NBWRA member agencies comment[s]) in the comment log.
- The NBWRA member agencies will have 10 days to review the draft TM.
- It is assumed that the meeting will be attended by up to three Consultant staff and be up to two hours in duration.

Budget

Sea Level Rise Adaptation Plan															
Phase	Phase Description	Rene Guillen	Jacki Bates	Bernadette Visitacion-Sumida	Sara Romero	Total Labor Hours	Total Labor Effort	APC	Expenses	Total ODCs	ESA Cost	Total Sub Cost	Total Expense Cost	Total Expense Effort	Total Effort
		PM	PA	Project Oversight	Finance										
		\$203.00	\$122.00	\$268.00	\$98.00										
001	Project Management	20	16	2	4	42	\$7,148	\$336	\$0	\$0	\$6,000	\$6,000	\$6,000	\$6,636	\$13,784
002	Strategic Outreach and Coordination	0	0	0	0	0	\$0	\$0	\$1,000	\$1,000	\$13,100	\$13,100	\$14,100	\$14,805	\$14,805
003	Decision Making Framework	0	0	0	0	0	\$0	\$0	\$500	\$500	\$13,000	\$13,000	\$13,500	\$14,175	\$14,175
004	Risks and Vulnerabilities	0	0	0	0	0	\$0	\$0	\$500	\$500	\$19,800	\$19,800	\$20,300	\$21,315	\$21,315
005	Adaptation Options	0	0	0	0	0	\$0	\$0	\$500	\$500	\$29,000	\$29,000	\$29,500	\$30,975	\$30,975
006	Concepts for Consideration	0	0	0	0	0	\$0	\$0	\$500	\$500	\$19,500	\$19,500	\$20,000	\$21,000	\$21,000
007	Next Steps Strategy	0	0	0	0	0	\$0	\$0	\$500	\$500	\$4,250	\$4,250	\$4,750	\$4,988	\$4,988
GRAND TOTAL		20	16	2	4	42	\$7,148	\$336	\$3,500	\$3,500	\$104,650	\$104,650	\$108,150	\$113,894	\$121,042

Hours and Dollars are rounded to nearest whole number. To display decimals, change the format of the cells.

ITEM NO. 6 COLLABORATIVE EFFORTS WITH NBWA

Action Requested

None at this time.

Summary

The introductory meeting was held on July 25, 2023 via Zoom. The attendance included the following:

NBWA: Jean Mariani, Jack Gibson, and Andy Rogers

NBWRA: David Rabbitt and Chuck Weir

Others Present: Sandeep Karkal

The group agreed on holding a 2-4 hour small group in person workshop to further discuss and develop plans for cooperative efforts and collaboration. As of this writing, a suitable time for the meeting has not been established due to scheduling conflicts.

Recommendation

None at this time.

ITEM NO. 7 FY2024/25 BUDGET

Action Requested

None at this time.

Summary

There are adequate funds from the FYE23 Budget to complete the Resilience Arena Scopes during this fiscal year, FYE24. If there is a desire from the member agencies to expand any of the existing Resilience Arenas into actual projects or develop new ones, efforts should be made to develop a budget for FYE25. Ongoing discussions at the TAC and Board level will determine what may be needed for FYE25.

Recommendation

None at this time.